

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Private Restraints on Competition and Energy Transmission as a Natural Monopoly	3
1.2	Anti-competitive Practices by Vertically Integrated Energy Undertakings	4
1.3	Unbundling Measures in Context: Behavioral and Structural Regulatory Approaches	6
1.4	Unbundling as a Cross-Sectoral and Global Policy Approach	9
1.5	The Focus of Previous Research	13
1.6	The Subject and Relevance of This Book	17
1.7	The Course of This Book	19
2	The Unbundling and Unbundling-Related Measures in the EU Energy Sector	21
2.1	The First and Second Energy Packages	21
2.2	Draft Directives Proposed by the European Commission	23
2.3	The Third Energy Package	26
2.3.1	Unbundling Requirements	26
2.3.1.1	The Three Unbundling Models	26
2.3.1.2	Choice Between Unbundling Models	34
2.3.1.3	Unbundling Requirements for State-Owned Entities	36
2.3.1.4	Extraterritorial Application of the Ownership Unbundling Requirements	38
2.3.1.5	Third Country Companies and Ownership Unbundling Requirements	42
2.3.2	Certification	46
2.3.2.1	General Certification Procedure	46
2.3.2.2	The Certification Procedure in Relation to Third Countries	47

- 2.3.2.3 Certification Practice in Relation to Third Countries 50
 - 2.3.3 Exemptions from Unbundling 54
 - 2.3.3.1 General Exemption Procedure 54
 - 2.3.3.2 Exemption Decisions and Third Countries 58
 - 2.4 Ownership Unbundling and General EU Competition Law 60
- 3 Ownership Unbundling and National Constitutional Law and EU Law: A Brief Summary of the Relevant Legal Issues 65**
 - 3.1 Introduction 65
 - 3.2 National Constitutional Law 66
 - 3.3 EU Law 69
 - 3.4 The Essent Case 75
- 4 International Economic Law as a Possible Limit to the Implementation of Unbundling and Unbundling-Related Measures: WTO Law 83**
 - 4.1 Introduction 83
 - 4.2 Energy Services Within the Meaning of the GATS 86
 - 4.3 Are Energy Services ‘Services Supplied in the Exercise of Governmental Authority’? 91
 - 4.4 Commitments on Energy Services Within the GATS Framework 93
 - 4.5 Article XVI GATS (Market Access) 101
 - 4.5.1 Quantitative Limitations 104
 - 4.5.2 Limitations on Forms of Legal Entity 112
 - 4.5.3 Limitations on Foreign Capital Participation 116
 - 4.5.4 PTAs Addressing the Relationship Between Ownership Unbundling and Market Access Obligations 118
 - 4.6 Article XVII GATS (National Treatment) 120
 - 4.6.1 Likeness Analysis 122
 - 4.6.1.1 Relationship Between Likeness of Services and Likeness of Service Suppliers 122
 - 4.6.1.2 Interpretation of Likeness: GATS Jurisprudence 124
 - 4.6.1.3 Likeness of Service Suppliers in the Context of the TEP 126
 - 4.6.1.4 Likeness of Services in the Context of the TEP 129
 - 4.6.2 No Less Favorable Treatment 130
 - 4.6.2.1 Certification Procedure in Relation to Third Countries 130
 - 4.6.2.2 Individual Ownership Unbundling Exemption Decisions 132
 - 4.6.2.3 The Ownership Unbundling Exemption Regime 140

	4.6.2.4	Special Ownership Unbundling Requirements for Public Companies	145
4.7		Article II GATS (Most-Favored-Nation Treatment)	150
	4.7.1	Likeness of Services or Service Suppliers	152
	4.7.2	No Less Favorable Treatment	153
	4.7.2.1	Individual Ownership Unbundling Exemption Decisions	153
	4.7.2.2	Variety of Unbundling Models (OU, ISO & ITO)	155
	4.7.2.3	The Certification Procedure in Relation to Third Countries	158
4.8		Article VI GATS (Domestic Regulation)	163
	4.8.1	Article VI:1 GATS: Reasonable, Objective and Impartial Administration	163
	4.8.1.1	Exemptions from Ownership Unbundling: Interpretation of the Notion of 'Interconnector'	166
	4.8.1.2	Application of Unbundling Rules to Offshore Sections of Gas Import Pipelines	170
	4.8.2	Article VI:4/5 GATS: Substantive Disciplines on Domestic Regulation	175
4.9		Article XIV (General Exceptions)	184
	4.9.1	Public Interest Grounds and the Unbundling Regime Under the TEP	185
	4.9.2	Unbundling and Unbundling-Related Measures and the Security of Energy Supply	187
4.10		Article XIV ^{bis} (Security Exceptions)	194
4.11		Conclusions	198
5		International Economic Law as a Possible Limit to the Implementation of Unbundling and Unbundling-Related Measures: International Investment Law	203
	5.1	Introduction	203
	5.2	The Framework for Investor-State Claims	207
	5.3	Admission Rights	209
	5.4	National Treatment Obligation	211
	5.5	MFN Treatment Obligation	215
	5.6	Protection from Direct or Indirect Expropriation	219
	5.6.1	Introduction	219
	5.6.2	Compulsory Sale of an Investment: Taking Stock	221
	5.6.3	Ownership Unbundling Measures as a Compulsory Sale of Investments	229
	5.6.4	Legality of Expropriations	238
	5.7	The Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard	243
	5.7.1	Introduction	243

5.7.2	Legitimate Expectations and the Stability of the Legal Framework	244
5.7.2.1	An Obligation Not to Modify the Regulatory Framework?	245
5.7.2.2	Possible Exceptions to the General Rule	253
5.7.3	Unreasonable and Disproportionate Changes to the Legal Framework	257
5.7.3.1	Proportionality as an Element of FET	257
5.7.3.2	Proportionality and Ownership Unbundling Measures	260
5.8	Conclusions	270
6	International Economic Law as a Possible Vehicle for the Implementation of Unbundling Measures	273
6.1	Introduction	273
6.2	The Development of International Competition Law	277
6.3	Existing Competition Law Provisions in the WTO Agreements	281
6.3.1	Article VIII GATS	281
6.3.2	Article IX GATS	288
6.3.3	Article XVII GATT	288
6.4	A Reference Paper for Energy Services Within the WTO Framework	292
6.4.1	Experience in the Telecommunications Sector	293
6.4.1.1	The Annex on Telecommunications	293
6.4.1.2	The Reference Paper on Basic Telecommunications Services	296
6.4.2	Experience in the Tourism Sector	303
6.4.3	Experience from Bilateral and Regional Agreements with Energy-Specific Provisions	306
6.4.4	The Way Forward: Developing a Reference Paper for Energy Services	310
6.4.4.1	General Observations	310
6.4.4.2	A Reference Paper on Energy Services and Unbundling Requirements	311
6.5	Conclusions	315
7	Final Conclusions: Unbundling as a Competition Instrument in the Light of International Trade and Investment Law	317
7.1	The First Direct Legal Challenge to Unbundling Is Based on International Economic Law	317
7.2	The EU and Its Member States Are Free to Impose OU, Subject to Conditions	318
7.3	EU Member States Cannot Be Forced to Privatize Their TSOs/Commercial Energy Companies	320

7.4	The Plurality of Unbundling Models Among EU Member States Can Be Preserved	320
7.5	The Application of Unbundling Requirements to Offshore Gas Pipelines Should Be Clarified	321
7.6	The EU's Ownership Unbundling Exemption Regime Can Be Maintained As It Is	322
7.7	The Third-Country Certification Procedure Is Discriminatory but Can Nevertheless Be Justified	323
7.8	Vertical Integration Is a Barrier to Energy Trade, and WTO Law As It Stands Is Unable to Provide a Solution	324
7.9	A Future Energy Reference Paper Should Contain Common Disciplines on Unbundling	325
	Table of Cases	327
	Legislation	335
	Documents	341
	Bibliography	355